

CLEAR - Creativity and innovation: pedagogical framework for the LEARning chain







To spread creativity practices to foster innovation in Italy, United Kingdom, Belgium, Spain and Norway by involving practitioners and policy makers in learning frameworks design and awareness raising events.

CLEAR website: www.clearcreativity.eu

Issues on creativity and innovation Literature review

By Francesco Pisanu e Paola Menapace (IPRASE Trentino)

Organizational structures/devices

- Leadership (direction, climate, autonomy,)and motivation)
- Mentoring
- Accountability
- Trustworthiness
- Advocacy
- Organizational improvement
- Leading facilitation
- Performance coaching
- Servant leadership
- Team working

- Communication
- Coaching
- Project management
- Learning to learn
- Visioning
- Change management leadership
- Experiential, project-based learning environments
- Tutor confidence and ability to inspire



- Leadership and Innovation
- 2. Teamwork and Innovation



Theoretical framework:

Leadership and Innovation: Andrews & Farris, 1967; Barnowe, 1975; Weick, 1995; Mumford, Scott, Gaddis, & Strange, 2002; Vinarski-Peretz and Carmeli, 2011

Main Thesis: "Leader effectiveness is critical to the success of creative work in organization":

- Studies of the impact of leader effectiveness on the success of creative efforts typically produce validity coefficients in the .30-to-.40 range
- One way to improve creativity and innovation is by improving leadership performance
- Leader may have sizable effects through a variety of mechanisms such as direction, climate, autonomy, and motivation
- The literature explores some techniques aiming at enhancing the capability for effective leadership of creative efforts



Hunter and Cushenbery (2011) explore the role leaders may have on creative teams analyzing some direct/indirect effects such as:

- Climate
- Role modeling
- Vision definition
- Recognition

McEntire and Greene-Shortridge (2011) analyze some recruitment techniques to select those asked to lead creative efforts such as:

- Use of professional networks for recruitment
- Panel interviews for selection
- Behavioural assessments
- Behaviourally based interviews
- Innovation targeted succession planning



Williams and Foti (2011) stress the importance of formal instruction based on:

- creative problem solving
- thinking skills
- divergent and convergent thinking

Ligon, Wallace and Osburn (2011) stress the importance of a systematic mentoring among other requirements:

- Knowledge
- Skills
- Abilities
- Experential development
- Mentoring



Antes and Schuelke (2011) point out the lack of clearly articulated objectives for developmental programs. They describe a number of tecniques which allow leaders to capitalize on experiential, case-based knowledge:

- Simulations
- E-mentoring
- Multisource feedback
- Social media
- Succession planing programs

Waples and Friedrich (2011) merge findings from literature about creativity with literature about leadership and performance management. Tecniques such as goal setting and performance appraisal prove to be fruitful if these are applied in an opened and creative way



Gilley and Shelton (2011) propose one potential competence-based system for the management of creativity in organizations

Key-competences are:

- Accountability
- Trustworthiness
- Advocacy
- Organizational improvements

Key-roles are:

- Leading facilitation
- Motivation
- Performance coaching
- Servant leadership



Theoretical framework:

▶ Teamwork and Innovation: Amabile, 1983, 1996; James et al., 1984; Watson et al. 1991; Diehl & Stroebe, 1991; Weick & Roberts, 1993; Ford, 1996; Ruscio et al., 1998; Madhavan & Grover, 1998; Sicotte & Langley, 2000; Schulz & Hardt et al., 2000; Hoegl & Gemuenden, 2001; Taggar, 2002; Okhuysen & Eisenhardt, 2002; Thompson, 2003

Example from the article: Hoegl, M. & Parboteeah, K.P., (2007), creativity in innovative projects: how teamwork matters, *Journal of engineering and technology management*, Vol. 24, pp. 148-166

Main Thesis: the quality of teamwork is an important moderating condition facilitating the application of domain-relevant skills, while obstructing the application of creative thinking skills



Teamwork quality as a construct with six facets:

- Communication
- Coordination
- Balance of members contribution
- Mutual support
- Effort
- Cohesion



Subjects of the research and design of research:

- 145 software development teams from 4 German software development laboratories
- A total of 575 data collection session with members, leaders, and team external managers referring to 145 software development teams were conducted



Results of research:

- Teamwork quality significantly negatively moderates the relationships of creative-thinking skills with effectiveness and efficiency
- Teamwork quality significantly positively moderates the relationship between domain-relevant skills and team efficiency, but not between domain-relevant skills and team effectiveness
- Teamwork quality shows a direct relationship with team effectiveness



Individual characteristics

- Knowledge
- Skills
- Abilities
- Autonomy
- Motivation
- Entrepreneurial behaviour
- Entrepreneurial opportunities recognition
- Individual action and reflection
- Personal attitudes toward creativity and innovation



- 1. Creativity and entrepreneurship
- 2. Creativity and opportunities search strategies



Theoretical Framework:

- Creativity and entrepreneurship: Sternberg and Lubart, 1999; Flynn et al., 2003; Ward, 2004; Zhao, 2005; Jackson et al., 2006; Gomez, 2007; Craft, 2008; Hytti et al., 2010; Hamidi et al., 2008; Penaluna et al., 2010; Carey & Matlay, 2010
- Creative economy: Sawyer, 2006; Florida, 2002; Howkins, 2001; Lee et al., 2004
- Learning and entrepreneurship: Rae & Carswell, 2000; Kuratko & Hodgetts, 1998; Van Vuuren, 1997; Gibb, 1985

Example from the article: Sarri, K.K., Bakouros, I.L., Petridou, E., (2010), Entrepreneur training for creativity and innovation, *Journal of European Industrial Training*, Vol. 34, Iss: 3, pp.270 - 288

Main thesis: Creativity is related to entrepreneurship. Studies have found that entrepreneurship and innovation are positively related to each other and interact to help an organization to flourish



- The article investigates the importance of entrepreneur training in creativity and innovation
- The purpose is to identify entrepreneurs' awareness, attitudes and perception in relation to creativity and innovation in order to design and develop training interventions
- Learning here is seen as a dynamic process which enables entrepreneurial behavior to be enacted



Subjects and design of research:

116 entrepreneurs from SMEs (small and medium enterprises) in three regions of the Northern Greece

The data gathered explored entrepreneurs' attitudes and perceptions toward these three areas:

- significance of creativity and innovation;
- importance and value of creativity and innovation in relation to the development of their business
- respondents' needs for training and tools on creativity and innovation



Findings:

- entrepreneurs are aware of the importance of creativity and innovation in all the three regions examined
- Entrepreneurs recognize their need for enhancement efforts in creativity and innovation training and tools, for themselves and for the other members of the organization
- Entrepreneurs identify lack of financial resources and availability of time as obstacles in participating in training programs



Theoretical framework:

- Viability of the business idea literature: Vesper and McMullan, 1988; Penaluna & Penaluna, 2008, 2009; Pittaway et al., 2009
- Creativity in entrepreneurship literature: Ward, 2004; Jackson et al., 2006; Gomez, 2007; Craft, 2008; Hytti et al., 2010; Hamidi et al., 2008; Penaluna et al., 2010; Carey & Matlay, 2010
- Opportunity search strategies literature: Miller, 1987; Kirzner, 1999; Ardichvili et al., 2003; Puhakka, 2007; Companys and McMullen, 2007; Tang & Khan, 2007; Heinonen et al., 2010

Example from the article: Heinonen, J., Hytti, U. and Stenholm, P., (2011), the role of creativity in opportunity search and business idea creation, *Education and Training*, Vol. 53, Iss: 8, pp. 659 - 672

Main Thesis: Distinctive strategies for searching out opportunities are proactive searching, knowledge acquisition, innovative behavior and collective action. Creative behavior comprises the search for opportunities in the external environment in a proactive and innovative way



- The article investigates relationships between student creativity, various opportunity search strategies, and the viability of business idea developed during an entrepreneurship education module
- The authors focus on two extreme opportunity search strategies, namely creative behavior and knowledge acquisition to illustrate the co-existence of art and science in the process of entrepreneurial opportunity recognition



The study investigates two facets of entrepreneurship:

- the art conceived here as creative and innovative thinking which can enable the viability of a business idea
- the science conceived here as business competence and knowledge

These two aspects are here conceived as two different types of opportunity search strategies



Subjects and design of research:

- 117 students participated in pre-programme and post-programme surveys
- The entrepreneurship education module was organized in three team groups. Students were assigned to create a business idea combining three different industries in a innovative way
- This assignment was designed to support idea generation as a creative process as showed in previous studies (role of team and student motivation in learning, Hytti et al., 2010)



Findings:

- Creativity is not directly associated with the viability of the business idea
- Influence of creativity on the viability of the business idea is fully mediated by those opportunity search strategies that are creative and based on knowledge acquisition
- Process of recognizing entrepreneurial opportunities involves individual action and reflection for the development of a business idea
- Creativity also has to be accompanied by opportunity search activities to generate viable business idea



Training methods/pedagogical practices

- Creative problem solving and thinking skills
- Experiential development
- Developmental objectives
- Learning prompts
- Reflection questions
- Leveraging technology via simulations
- E-mentoring
- Multisource feedback
- Social media
- Succession planning programs

- Regular peer reviews
- Assessment without examinations or writing
- Strategies of emotional engagement
- Considerations of process over output
- Extended self and peer assessment
- Practitioner-led engagement and experience of real life scenario



Training methods/pedagogical practices

- Business beyond the Box
- Lateral thinking
- De Bono course or six thinking hats
- Creative teaching
- Disciplined improvisation
- Constructivism
- Project-based learning
- Collaborative learning
- Contextualization
- Using metaphor
- Problem-based learning (PBL)

- Project learning
- Central conceptual structures
- Creative problem solving
- Emotional engagement
- Co-operative Learning
- Inquiry-based learning
- Formative assessment



- 1. Creativity and pedagogical practices
- 2. Creativity and assessment



Theoretical framework:

- Creativity literature: Robinson, 2001, 2009; Hargreaves, 2003; Sahlberg, 2009;
- Competitiveness and global sustainability in Educational Policies literature: Brundtland, 1987; Bils & Klenow, 2000; Rees, 2003; Steffen et al., 2007; Glaser et al., 2004; Porter et al., 2004, 2008; Meadows et al., 2004; UNESCO, 2005; Doppelt, 2008;

Example from the article: Sahlberg, P. and Oldroyd, D., (2010), Pedagogy for Economic Competitiveness and sustainable development, European Journal of Education, Vol. 45, No. 2, 2010, Part I

Main Thesis: The authors highlight the discrepancy between the policy of standardization of the Lisbon Strategy through comparative results studies such as PISA studies and the need to a certain degree of freedom in experimenting ways to achieve creativity and innovation in the current curricula. This requires, as the authors argued, wider and more frequent use of adequate methods of teaching and work that promote collaboration, creativity and focus on students' individual talents



Creativity as intended by Robinson (2001) as inventiveness to come up with new ideas, processes and products that have value

The article explores the three key conditions that make teaching compatible with the needs of competitiveness and sustainable development:

- New conception of Knowledge seen as relativistic and diverse in sense of interpretations and created through multiple processes, including hermeneutic and subjective scientific methods
- 2. Better understanding of innovation, intended here as a process of extraction of economic and social value from knowledge. It put ideas, knowledge and technology to work in a manner that brings about a significant improvement in performance
- Focus on social capital: successful economies and highly creative communities are based on the idea of strategic alliances rather than raw competition for markets and clients



The authors elaborated a table which summarize the main teaching and learning methods relating to creative skills for future competitiveness and sustainable development

The main approaches are:

1. Co-operative Learning

Main skills:

- Academic achievement
- Positive about self, subjects, learning and teachers
- Positive about others
- More effective interpersonal skills and relations
- Awareness of group collaborative processes

2. Problem-based learning (PBL)

Main skills:

 Problem-solving with application to both entrepreneurship and sustainable development based on finding creative solutions and building consensus



3. Project learning

Main skills:

 Project skills with application to both entrepreneurship and sustainable development with particular focus on use of ICT and evidence based decision-making

4. Central conceptual structures

Main skills:

- creative pedagogy of gaming
- story production
- musical composition

5. Creative problem solving

Main skills:

 powerful meta-cognitive process involving divergent and convergent thinking that can be applied to both entrepreneurial and environmental challenges



Main considerations:

The authors argued that such pedagogies and models are already available and have been tested by large-scale field experiments and empirical research since the early 20th century

A broader and less constricted curriculum and system of assessment are therefore needed to facilitate reformed methods of teaching



Theoretical framework:

 Assessment within entrepreneurship education literature: Pittaway and Cope (2007); Penaluna and Penaluna, 2006, 2008; Carey and Matlay, 2007;

Example from the article: Carey, C., Matlay, H., (2010), creative disciplines education: a model for assenssing ideas in entrepreneurship education?, Education & Training, Vol. 52, Iss: 8, pp.694-709

Main Thesis: Current practices in art and design schools within the formal system of Higher Education in the UK have recently received some attention, especially regarding the way these schools deliver curricula and their approaches to assessing student's work



Creative disciplines education is characterized by experiential, project-based learning environments and regular peer reviews

Educators in this field are frequently also practitioners

Assessing Methods from these discipline that are here highlighted are:

- Assessment without examinations or writing
- Strategies of emotional engagement
- Considerations of process over output
- Extended self and peer assessment
- Practitioner-led engagement and experience of real life scenario



Subjects and design of research:

- Entrepreneurs from 13 sub-sectors of the creative industry sector (13 subjects)
- Respondents to the survey were distinguished in 8 different types of educators and practitioners from different creative disciplines (design, advertising, music, etc.)
- The exploration of different creative styles and ideas suggested to adopt these techniques by generic enterprise education in business schools and other faculties



Main results:

- Assessment is often characterized by formative, peer enabled and discussion based techniques
- Students are required to present publicly their work and ideas
- Assessment process is firmly positioned within the context of a critique
- Ideas assessment techniques within creative disciplines are well embedded in practice and applied consistently in the context of an academic framework

The article stresses the importance of the educator's relationship to industry, this link offers a real world perspective and helps students to contextualize their works and ideas



Training content

- Divergent and convergent thinking
- brainstorming
- mind-mapping
- lateral thinking
- morphological analysis
- Team working
- Communication
- Project management

- Student-centered pedagogy
- Work-based learning
- Experiential learning
- ability to visualize ideas
- effective use of memory to integrate new knowledge with prior knowledge



- Creativity and Tertiary Education
- 2. Creativity and Secondary Education



Theoretical framework:

- Work-based learning literature: Dewey, 1938; Polanyi, 1966; Kolb, 1985; Levi et al., 1989; Brennan and Little, 1996; Bransford et al., 2000; Boud and Symes, 2000
- Experiential learning that promote creativity and innovation: Gibb, 1996, 2002; Cope and Watts, 2000; Hannon, 2004; Pittaway and Cope, 2005; Solomon, 2005; Smith et al., 2006; Rae, 2010
- Creative teaching literature: Amabile, 1983; Bereiter, 2002; Sawyer, 2004; Simon and Hicks, 2006; Grainger, Barnes and Scoffham, 2004; Cutler, 2003;
- Characteristics of creative thinking: DeWulf and Baillie, 1998; De Bono, 1970; Nickerson, 1999; Michalko, 2006

Example from the article: Gibson, R., (2010), The art of creative teaching: implications for higher education, Teaching in Higher Education, Vol. 15, Iss:5, pp. 607 – 613

Main Thesis: The article explores the subversive nature of creativity, the value of creative teaching and proposes a number of strategies Higher Education universities should adopt in their curricula. The author considers the role played by the educational environment in developing students' creativity and asks himself if creativity is to be found in universities and colleges



The author propose a student-centered pedagogy for nurturing creativity in Higher Education. He gives some examples about a number of techniques which could be applied in tertiary institutions:

- Creative teaching requires an openness to experience, a willingness to take risks and healthy amounts of flexibility, spontaneity and open-mindedness
- Creative teaching should be viewed as disciplined improvisation because it always occurs within broad structures and existing frameworks

Creative teaching possesses the following characteristics:

- Active participation of the student
- Opportunity for inquiry-based learning
- Constructivism
- Project-based learning
- Collaborative learning



Creative teaching includes:

- Contextualization
- using metaphor
- style and pace of delivery
- tutor confidence and ability to inspire
- valuing students
- emotional engagement
- to reflects upon their own learning

Creative individuals produce better work if they are intrinsic motivated and personal committed rather than for an extrinsic reward

The communities that foster creativity should be:

- Opened for diversity
- Collaborative
- Opened to interdisciplinarity



He suggests some characteristics that the environment should assure for the development of creative potential of students:

- Adequate time for creative thinking
- Rewarding creative ideas, thoughts and products
- Encouraging risk-taking
- Allowing mistakes
- Imagining from various perspectives
- Questioning assumptions
- Identifying interests and problems
- Generating multiple hypothesis
- Focusing on broad Ideas
- Thinking about the thinking process



He argues also that competition, restricted choices, confirming pressures, evaluation, frequent failures can destroy this potential according to Amabile (1983). Characteristics of the university systems which do not foster creativity are:

- Competitive ranking system for the access to the university
- Transmissive pedagogical process of learning
- Mass lectures
- Stress-inducing examinations

He proposes as a possible tool a curriculum negotiation as a process whereby students have an active role about design and content of the learning and the learning outcomes



- Assessment should here be used to encourage interest, commitment and intellectual challenge as an ongoing activity
- Assessment should not be seen as a separate entity but integrated into the learning process
- The art of the assessment task can be also negotiated, it can be written, electronic, performance or visual mode
- Teachers should consider the use of partnership or learning teams who can work together about the assessment tasks
- peer assessment



Theoretical framework:

- Entrepreneurship studies literature: Pinchot, 1988; Wolff and von Wulffen, 1999; Schmitt-Rodermund and Silbereise, 1999; Paulini-Schlottau, 2004; Eickhoff, 2006; Hekman, 2006; Sternberg, Brixy and Schlapfner, 2006; Gonon, 2006; European Commission/DG Enterprise and Industry, 2005; Kuratorium der Deutschen Wirtschaft für Berufsbildung, 2006
- Creativity pedagogy literature: Koestler, 1964; Boden, 1990; Bourner and Flowers, 1997; Robinson, 2000; Florida, 2002; Eisner, 2005; Sternberg, 2006; Haring-Smith, 2006;
- Creative teaching literature: Amabile, 1983; Bereiter, 2002; Sawyer, 2004; Simon and Hicks, 2006;
 Grainger, Barnes and Scoffham, 2004; Cutler, 2003;

Example from the article: Eickhoff, M. Th., (2008), Entrepreneurial thinking and action- an educational responsibility for Europe, European Journal of Vocational Training, No. 45

Main goal: the article describes a possible implementation of a policy regarding entrepreneurship in formal education in all stages of education in Germany



- This article describes the Plan of the leading organizations of German trade and industry to promote entrepreneurial thinking and actions in general secondary education
- These competences are then also developed in continuing education training and in higher education
- The overall goal of the plan is to be able to ensure that young people can progress coherently in acquiring entrepreneurial competences in all stages of the educational system



This plan (Entrepreneurship Education Plan) is designed as a curriculum, covering all didactic issues:

- target group
- intentions
- content
- methods
- Monitoring of teaching/learning outcomes

Every stage involves a specific increase in competences in the form of continuous professionalization

The main aims are:

- Inclusion of entrepreneurship into the national curricula
- Providing support to schools and teachers



Children and young people (primary and general secondary education) should familiarize themselves with entrepreneurship as a positive basic attitude

The main actions to pursue this objective are:

- The knowledge of general enterprises' functions and their contributions to society
- To recognize entrepreneurship as an economic/competition factor and as an opportunity for the reintegration of unemployed and disadvantaged

The measures here suggested are:

- Better training for teachers working on team-teaching concepts, in which teachers and enterprise representatives simultaneously design the teaching
- Teachers should be provided with curricular recommendation, plans and topic-based media



- For vocational training students entrepreneurship should be "taught" as entrepreneurial attitude to work, which is required to entrepreneurs but in future also to employees
- This should lead to employability and to open up new career prospects in self-employment and to reduce youth unemployment
- Young people should try out their entrepreneurial skills in training, in planning games or student firms activities

In Vocational schools methods should be:

- case studies
- planning games or projects
- teachers and enterprise trainers should be trained in entrepreneurship
- The exchange of experience between practitioners should be enforced



In continuing vocational training and higher education entrepreneurship can be integrated into existing topics

Some suggested measures here are:

- manager training or lecture series
- seminars on setting up in business
- further guidance and coaching





CLEAR - Creativity and innovation: pedagogical framework for the LEARning chain

CLEAR website: www.clearcreativity.eu

